

## Karolinska Institutet's references to clear Dr Macchiarini from scientific misconduct

ANNEX NUMBER in the DECISION (1) presented by Vice-Chancellor Hamsten on Aug 28, 2015 to acquit PM from all allegations of research misconduct concerning the ESOPHAGUS article	ANNEX NUMBER in the DECISION (2) presented by Vice-Chancellor Hamsten on Aug 28, 2015 to acquit PM from all allegations of research misconduct concerning the 6 TRACHEA articles	REFERENCE PERSONS given by the Vice-Chancellor Hamsten in his 2 DECISIONS (1,2) to absolve Dr Macchiarini (PM) from all allegations of scientific misconduct proven by Prof Gerdin in 7 out of 7 reported articles	CO-AUTHORSHIP in the TRACHEA Articles 1-6 ESOPHAGUS Article 7	NUMBERS OF ARTICLES PER REFERENCE NAME where co-authorship is present with PM in the 7 articles reported containing evidence of scientific misconduct	TOTAL NUMBERS OF CO-AUTHORSHIP PER REFERENCE NAME with PM (PubMed)	AFFILIATION 1. Karolinska Institutet (KI) 2. Karolinska University Hospital (KS) Other affiliations stated by name	PRO PM RESEARCH clearing PM from allegations of scientific misconduct (biased references)	CON PM RESEARCH reporting PM for scientific misconduct	IN-DEPENDENT REVIEW OF PM RESEARCH	COMMENTS
1	1,2,3,11	<b>Matthias Corbascio</b>	3	1	1	1,2	-	1	-	Complainant
1	1,2,3,11	<b>Karl-Henrik Grinnemo</b>	1,3	2	3	1,2	-	1	-	Complainant. Directly involved in the implantation in Case 1
1	1,2,3,11	<b>Oscar Simonson</b>	3	1	1	1,2	-	1	-	Complainant
-	1,2,11	<b>Thomas Fux</b>	0	0	0	1,2	-	1	-	Complainant
2,4	4,6,33	<b>Paolo Macchiarini</b>	-	-	-	1,2 ACTREM (1), CLINTEC (2), ENT (3)	-	-	-	-
3	5	<b>Bengt Gerdin</b>	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	<b>INDEPENDENT EXTERNAL INVESTIGATOR</b>
6	-	<b>Miguel Burguillos</b>	7	1	2	1	1	-	-	
-	7	<b>Evren Alici</b>	1	1	2	1	1	-	-	
7	-	<b>Peter Damberg</b>	7	1	1	1 CLINTEC	1	-	-	Collaborator to PM.
5	8	<b>Antonio Beltran Rodriguez</b>	6,7	2	5	1,2 ACTREM, CLINTEC, ENT	1	-	-	
-	9	<b>Pontus Blomberg</b>	1	1	1	2	1	-	-	

-	10	<b>Bela Bozoky</b>	1	1	1	2	1	-	-	Stating the biopsy findings which have manipulated in the in the 7 articles.
-	12	<b>Claire Crowley</b>	1	1	1	UCL (4), London	1	-	-	PhD student to Prof Seifalian UCL, former partner to PM and manufacturer of the synthetic (POSS-PCU) tracheal implant for Case 1.
-	13	<b>Tomas Gudbjartsson</b>	1	1	1	Landspítali, Reykjavík, Iceland	1	-	-	Directly involved in the implantation of KS Case 1. Referring doctor and responsible for Case 1 after returning to Iceland.
-	13	<b>Oskar Einarsson</b>	1	1	1	Landspítali, Reykjavík, Iceland	1	-	-	
8	14, 23	<b>Johannes Haag</b>	3,6,7	3	13	1,2 ACTREM, CLINTEC, ENT	1	-	-	Member of PM:s research group.
9	-	<b>Rainer Heuchel</b>	7	1	1	1 CLINTEC	1	-	-	
-	15	<b>Gert Henriksson</b>	1	1	2	1, KI, ENT	1	-	-	
-	16	<b>Ola Hermanson (OH)</b>	1	1	1	1, Member of the KI ethical counsel	1	-	-	<b>Key PM defender, publishing a 8 pages report (incl. sending it to the website retractionwatch.com)</b> Except explaining his own role he also attacks the external investigator Prof Gerdin and the 4 complainants concluding with the statement " <i>The accusations of scientific misconduct are thus completely unwarranted.</i> "
10	-	<b>Cristian Ibarra</b>	7	1	1	1	1	-	-	

11	-	<b>Joseph Bertrand</b>	7	1	2	1	1	-	-	
12	17,23	<b>Philipp Jungebluth (PJ)</b>	1,3,5,6,7	5	34	1,2 ACTREM, CLINTEC, ENT	1	-	-	Executive Director ACTREM. Close friend and ally to PM. Key member of PM:s research team. Directly involved in the implantations.
13	-	<b>Karolina Kublickiene</b>	7	1	1	1 CLINTEC	1	-	-	
-	18	<b>Jan-Erik Juto</b>	1	1	2	1 CLINTEC	1	-	-	
-	19	<b>Sylvie Le Guyader</b>	1	1	1	1	1	-	-	
-	20	<b>Bertil Leidner</b>	1	1	1	2	1	-	-	
14	21	<b>Greg Lemon</b>	3,6,7	3	10	1 ACTREM	1	-	-	Closely connected to trachea scaffold US company HART and closely affiliated and member of PM:s research group.
15	22,23	<b>Mei Lim Ling</b>	3,6,7	3	13	1,2 ACTREM, CLINTEC, ENT	1	-	-	Member of PM:s research group. Directly involved in the implantations.
16	23,25	<b>Sebastian Sjöqvist</b>	3,6,7	3	10	1,2 ACTREM, CLINTEC, ENT	1	-	-	Member of PM:s research group. Directly involved in the implantations.
17	-	<b>Ying Zhao</b>	7	1	1	1 CLINTEC	1	-	-	
-	24	<b>Guido Moll</b>	1	1	3	1	1	-	-	Informed Case 1 together with PJ, about practical aspects of the planned procedure despite PJ and GM not being registered doctors in Sweden. Closely affiliated to PM. Directly involved in the implantations.
-	24	<b>Bo Nilsson</b>	1	1	1	Uppsala University, Sweden	1	-	-	
-	24	<b>Katarina Le Blanc</b>	1	1	2	1,2	1	-	-	Collaborator to PM, responsible for stem

										cell aspiration in the first KS patient.
-	26	Staffan Strömblad	1,3	2	2	1	1	-	-	
-	27	Tolga Sutlu	1	1	1	1	1	-	-	
-	28	Ana Isabel Teixeira	1	1	4	1	1	-	-	Previous PhD student to Prof Ola Hermanson. Working in the Institution which is led by Prof Urban Lendahl.
-	29	Stephen Badylak	2	1	1	McGowan Institute, USA	1	-	-	Research allied with PM.
-	29	Arthur Caplan	2	1	3	University of Pennsylvania, USA	1	-	-	Research allied with PM.
-	29	Daniel J Weiss	2	1	2	University of Pennsylvania, USA	1	-	-	Research allied with PM.
-	30	Reference to "Official note" by the Karolinska University Hospital (KS) local ethics counsel	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	<b>The KS local ethics counsel does neither have mandate to decide in these matters or has registered any official note or meeting memorandum concerning Case 1.</b>
-	31	ISSCR Guidelines, Recommendation number 39 referred to by PM et al.	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	This ISSCR reference is a manipulation by PM and his defenders, as is the reference to the Declaration of Helsinki (WMA) which PM et al. and KI key persons also repeatedly have referred to but surprisingly was not mentioned by the Vice-Chancellor in his acquitting reference list. <b>According to WMA and ISSCR "it is not allowed to "pick and chose" selected paragraphs in these</b>

										<i>guidelines after what seems to suit ones purposes. All paragraphs has to be adopted and respected."</i>
-	32	<b>Cengiz Gebitekin</b>	0	0	0	Bursa, Turkey	1	-	-	Close friend to PM since 15 yrs. Responsible for referring Case 3 to PM.
-	32	<b>Adnan Sayar</b>	0	0	0	Istanbul, Turkey	1	-	-	Close friend to Cengiz Gebitekin. Responsible for referring Case 3 to PM.
		<b>KAROLINSKA INSTITUTET</b>								
-	-	<b>Anders Hamsten (AH)</b>	-	-	-	Vice-Chancellor KI	1	-	-	Main responsible to acquit PM from all allegations of scientific misconduct in 7 out of 7 reported articles despite overwhelming evidence of the opposite presented by the external reviewer Prof Gerdin.
-	-	<b>Urban Lendahl (UL)</b>	-	-	-	Director StratRegen (5), KI. Secretary of the Nobel Assembly at Karolinska Institutet and the Nobel Committee for Physiology and Medicine.	1	-	-	Superior to PM, key PM defender since start. Key person involved in the cover-up of the clarification of KI:s involvement in PM:s implantations. Part of the committee (together with Profs Hamsten, Carlstedt-Duke and Dr Bratt) that finally presented that PM was acquitted from all allegations of scientific misconduct.
-	-	<b>Jan Carlstedt-Duke (JCD)</b>	-	-	-	Adviser (Rektorsråd) to the Vice-Chancellor, KI	1	-	-	Adviser to the Vice-Chancellor (Rektorsråd). Key person involved in the

										cover-up of the clarification of KI:s involvement in PM:s implantations. Key person in the manipulations concerning the invention and statement of presence of ethical vetting which has been proven not to exist.
-	-	<b>Per Bengtsson</b>	-	-	-	University Director, KI	1	-	-	Key person involved in the cover-up of the clarification of KI:s involvement in PM:s implantations.
-	-	<b>Marie Tell</b>	-	-	-	Deputy University Director	1	-	-	
-	-	<b>Hans-Gustaf Ljungren</b>	-	-	-	Dean of Research, KI	1	-	-	Key person involved in the cover-up of the clarification of KI:s involvement in PM:s implantations.
-	-	<b>Andrea Montano Montes</b>	-	-	-	Vice-Chair of the Medical Student's Organization	1	-	-	
-	-	<b>Li Felländer-Tsai</b>	-	-	-	Prefect CLINTEC KI	1	-	-	Superior to PM, Head of unit, key PM defender since start, recruiting and defending PM, key person involved in the cover-up of the clarification of PM:s implantations. Together with Prof Cardell main author of the document "Beslut om fortsatt anställning av PM som gästprofessor i regenerativ kirurgi vid Karolinska Institutet.." signed by AH 2014-01-14 where Prof Felländer-Tsai in detail

										describes KI:s full involvement and knowledge about the Russian implantations (Beslut gästprof 140114 sidor 7-9). Manipulations concerning ethical approval of the implantations at Karolinska, which have been proven not to exist.
-	-	Lars-Olaf Cardell	-	-	-	CLINTEC, ENT, KI	1	-	-	Superior to PM, Head of unit, key PM defender since start, recruiting and defending PM and a key person involved in the cover-up of the clarification of PM:s implantations. Together with Prof Felländer-Tsai main author of the document " <b>Beslut om fortsatt anställning av PM som gästprofessor i regenerativ kirurgi vid Karolinska institutet..</b> " signed by AH 2014-01-14 where Prof Cardell in detail describes KI:s full involvement and knowledge about all KS pts incl. the Russian implantations (se beslut gästprof 140114 sidor 7-9). Involved in discussions concerning the Russian transplant candidates (Krasnodar documents 2012-02-16).

-	-	<b>Rickard Kuylenstierna</b>	-	-	-	ENT, CLINTEC, KI	1	-	-	Collaborator and key PM defender since start, recruiting and heavily defending PM and a key person involved in the cover-up of the clarification of PM:s implantations. Serial manipulating concerning existent ethical vetting and approval by the Medical Product Agency which has been proven not to exist. Involved in discussions concerning the Russian transplant candidates (Krasnodar documents 2012-02-16).
		<b>Karolinska University Hospital</b>								
-	-	<b>Johan Bratt (JB)</b>	-	-	-	Chief Medical Officer, KS (6)	1	-	-	Involved from the Karolinska University Hospital in the planned retaliations of the 4 complainants. Part of the committee (together with AH, UL, JCD) that finally presented that PM was acquitted from all allegations of scientific misconduct.
							<b>PRO PM 46</b>	<b>CON PM 4</b>	<b>INDEP PM 1</b>	

1. ACTREM (Advanced Center for Translational Regenerative Medicine), Karolinska Institutet
2. CLINTEC (Department of Clinical Science, Intervention and Technology)
3. ENT (Department of Ear, Nose and Throat, Karolinska University Hospital)
4. UCL (University College London)
5. StratRegen (The Strategic Research Area in Stem Cells and Regenerative Medicine), Karolinska Institutet
6. KS (Karolinska University Hospital)